



Croatian
International
Relations
Review

—
CIRR

—
XXVIII (89) 2022,
269-285

—
DOI 10.2478/
CIRR-2022-0016

—
UDC 327 (4-6
EU:73:55)

Parallelism and Civil Resistance: A Sui Generis Path Towards Self-Determination in Kosovo

Florent Rrahmani

Department of Sociology University of Prishtina

“Hasan Prishtina” – Prishtina, Kosovo

Email: floenttrahmanizprk1@gmail.com

Abstract

Key words:
Kosovo,
parallelism, civil
resistance, sui
generis, self-
determination

In Kosovo, from 1989 to 1999, an entire decade of living between civil resistance and parallel life has been transformed into a quest for the right to self-determination. This is the reality created by self-organization as the only means of survival when all institutional lifelines are severed. Consequently, new types of reorganization were implemented. In this sense, this study studied the parallel existence and civil resistance in Kosovo as a fiction of the harsh living reality that resulted from the collective exclusion at the time of the fall of Yugoslavia. As a result of the constitutional amendments of 1989, the efforts for self-organization within this reality, as an effort to preserve the ties between the society inside and outside the country, became pillars of civil and political resistance, surpassing all the threads at the limits of that unique socio-political situation, within such a constitutionally violated reality. Parallel resistance allowed Kosovo to survive and set the stage for a 1999 post-war self-determination process. This study contributes to the body of knowledge by addressing the rarely treated aspect of parallel existence and civic resistance in Kosovo. The study's theoretical contribution supplied practitioners with numerous insights.

Introduction

Many times, Kosovo's democratic and political path during the nineties of the last century has been qualified as a sui generis case. Moreover, this dimension became crucial in the interpretation of the International Court of Justice with regard to the declaration of independence by Kosovo authorities in February 17, 2008, after a period of international protectorate since 1999. In this perspective, the treatment of certain equally unavoidable measures necessary by a scenario created by the constitutional amendments of 1989 was deemed useful, whereby numerous protected rights were derogated and Albanians were robbed of institutions essential to preserving a normal way of life. The following sections will examine how out-of-the-ordinary activities disturb the normal social order and lead to an extraordinary circumstance that undermines the entire individual and communal order.

The breakdown of order in Kosovo at the start of the 1990s was accompanied by enormous job expulsions, structural/ethnic shifts inside institutions, and overt colonization attempts. These and other efforts of a similar sort were obvious in favors to the Serbian citizenry and belonging, and Albanians were subjected to discrimination on all fronts. As a result, the right to self-determination has been violated on multiple fronts, with the political sphere being the least respected. It was exactly the unwillingness to respect it that provided a further impetus for civic resistance and parallelism.

In this article, the parallel state or parallelism notion is more specific than the contemporary concepts of "state within a state", "the deep state," or "dual state." [Ambinder and Grady \(2013\)](#); [Kyle, Jessop, Al-Sabah, and](#)

Whitaker (2017); Michaels (2018); Müllerson (2009); Scott (2014); (Tunander, 1989) recognizing that the parallel state of Kosovo appears as an open rival of the "official" state, due to its ethnic and political circumstances that justify it. In addition, the concept of civil resistance Beer (2021); Carter (2009); Chenoweth and Stephan (2013); Clark (2000); Kalyvas and Kocher (2009); Roberts and Ash (2011) acknowledges the current framework of "civil resistance studies." Perhaps Chenoweth's characterization of civil resistance as an unarmed civilian activity characterized by nonviolent resistance, unarmed struggle, or nonviolent action against the regime without directly threatening physical harm to the adversary is the most accurate description of Kosovo's civil residence.

It was precisely the political experience of the parallel state and the civil resistance that were precursors of the status of Kosovo and its *sui generis* case evaluation. It is not by chance that the International Court of Justice will base its Accordance with international law regarding the unilateral declaration of independence in respect of Kosovo on "specific circumstances that make Kosovo a case that is *sui generis* resulting from the disintegration of former-Yugoslavia, including the historical context of Yugoslavia's violent break-up as well as the massive violence and repression that took place in Kosovo" Weller (2009). Therefore, it might be presumed that throughout the entire history of the *sui generis* status of Kosovo, an essential part of this status deals with its historical path toward the final status. By designing it incrementally, the parallel state of civil resistance became a cornerstone for the independence of Kosovo in 2008.

This study concludes with an attempt to evaluate the dimension of parallel existence and civil resistance in Kosovo as a figment of the harsh living reality that resulted from collective exclusion at the time of the break-up of Yugoslavia. This objective of the study is of fundamental importance to the body of knowledge since the dimension of parallel existence and civic resistance in Kosovo as a mirage of harsh reality is rarely addressed in previous studies. This is an original study that investigated self-determination and civic resistance in Kosovo. Earlier research has not addressed the significance of self-determination and civic resistance in Kosovo. Literature addresses self-determination and civil resistance Bamber and Svensson (2022); Shapiro (1994); Van den Broeck, Howard, Van Vaerenbergh, Leroy, and Gagné (2021) but Kosovo does not explore this link. This study therefore has significant theoretical and practical consequences.

The Importance of the Paper

In the context of organized parallel resistances and parallelism itself on the path towards the realization of the right to self-determination, this paper comes as a novelty because it deals only with the case of Kosovo. So, this adds a new case, well studied and clearly argued. Due to the significance of

the need for such a study, the focus of this study was on research, and in addition to being a paper, it will be made into a doctoral thesis.

The Structure of the Paper

Beginning with the point at which the overall disintegration of society starts between 1989 and 1999, the study elaborates on the evolution of life within these confines throughout the same time frame. As a result, the violation in the legal sphere has led to violations in the political, educational, health, and social spheres and the self-organization of the Kosovo society in all of these domains. The first section of the study is the introduction, which includes the study's problem, objective, and importance. The second section of the study is based on a literature evaluation of past investigations reviewed to the current research. The parallel system was thoroughly described in the literature review in light of past research. In addition, the third half of the study focuses on the study's methodology. The fourth component is based on the study's conclusion. This part addressed both the study's implications and its suggestions.

Literature Review

The primary literature of this study is local and foreign authors, such as Anton Berishaj with the study "Philanthropy in Kosovo", and "Society without state", Fehmi Agani with his studies, "Independence, probability and hope", Volume 7, "Democracy, the Nation, Self-Determination", Gene Sharp "From Dictatorship to Democracy", Howard Clark "Civil Resistance in Kosovo", but also other authors who have written on civil resistance and the building of a parallel life, such as: [Andersen \(1995\)](#); [Schok \(2015\)](#); [Clark \(2000\)](#); [Cooke \(2011\)](#); [Duponchelle, Paradis, Ribbink, and Turner \(2008\)](#); [Arendt \(1972\)](#); [Taylor, Foote, and Wood \(1996\)](#) , but also other authors.

Building the Parallel System

Recalling the early political situation in Kosovo thirty years ago, the age-old question of where human life begins and ends in the absence of political organization comes to mind. Do political "legal" institutions exclude the citizenry's lawful voice? When removed from the state, can society produce an internal self-organizing energy? There are a number of issues that require theoretical treatment, but at their core lies a history that speaks more than any political theory of the need for a state or the very need for an organization of life in general, institutional life in particular, when exclusion from the state itself is applied on the basis of ethnicity. The Kosovar society, heavily tested by such a reality, was forced to part ways with a system that left no room for cooperation between communities but divided them, as never before, favoring Serbs and discriminating against Albanians. That discrimination, and later division, began exactly in 1989-1990. It is precisely 1989 that marks Albanians' great deprivation from

many rights guaranteed to them by federal and local constitution. The new “legal” and constitutional amendments produced such deprivation and thus kick-started a legal, political, economic, social, educational, and health crisis in the country.

Over a decade in Kosovo, many other processes originated from those amendments, which constituted a heavy blow to Kosovo. According to [Stavileci \(1996, 293\)](#), three changes were the most critical and decisive in the abolition of autonomy: the overthrow of state power, including its legislative, executive, administrative, and judicial levels, followed by the two instances of its establishment (local and provincial governments); the destruction of the economy, with the intention of property alienation; and the collapse of social activities, including health, education, science, culture, and public information. Practically, these changes produced a completely new reality at all levels, and a new political reality above all. Significantly, the first attack came on justice itself, although justice is considered a primary condition for politics. While this primary condition was being attacked, the political reality was beginning to take a completely new direction, indicating thus a provocation based on direct political and constitutional violations. Hence, the first provocation was made through the “unilateral amendment of the Serbian Constitution”, which flagrantly contradicted the Constitution of Kosovo and the Constitution of the Yugoslav Multinational Federation, followed by police actions that were taken at the very moment when “potential tectonic waves that would tear Yugoslavia to many pieces were being felt and when Serbia was rushing to emerge from such fragmentation with Kosovo and Vojvodina as parts of it” ([Zajmi, 1996, 244](#)).

Serbia's motivation in this case was to achieve its objectives and create a new reality by first altering Kosovo's constitutional identity and then destroying institutional life and altering it from inside. This marked the start of a dual existence in Kosovo. This new reality results from such repressive connotation, affecting every aspect of existence and generating a more unstable, insecure, and hopeless state. In this way, the development of an entirely new legal, constitutional, and contradictory reality commenced. Given that the majority of the people, which was Albanian, remained wholly excluded from the constitution and legislative life, which predated their absence from institutional life, such measures were consistent with this paradox. This demonstrated that the constitutional modifications were merely a preamble to destroying the institutional and public life associated with Kosovo Albanians' rights. Similarly, there was a shift in the relationships between the communities, and there were steps toward constructing a socio-politically structured reality above the legal one. Thus, the legislative and constitutional modifications established a new social reality, preserving Serbia's explicit desire to alter the ground condition. But, why all this focus on the legal field?

The legal scene was where the new socio-political order began, which was constitutional and also constitutional and political and discriminatory.

Consequently, further acts emanated from this legal and constitutional foundation, in the spirit of efforts to create and bolster the concept of "dealbanization" of institutions. Thus, the plans to alter the personnel and purge the institutions of ethnic Albanians became a reality. Eventually, both the attempt to maintain the status quo and the desire to alter it were observed in the theater of conflict, and the reality was marked by ethnic and institutional conflicts, legal and parallel norms that excluded one another. Such a major social and political clash led to the deterioration of relations between the communities and prompted attempts to change the ethnic structure in Kosovo to carry out the plan of keeping the territory under control at all costs and turning the idea of recolonization into reality.

Politically speaking, the sole purpose of these legal and constitutional moves was to maintain control over Kosovo, including the ethnic cleansing that will occur a few years later. Legally, this was attempted through the Law on the Operation of Republican Bodies in Special Circumstances, primarily through the assumption of powers. This law paved the way for another degrading step via mass expulsions from institutional life and jobs following the general strike of 3 September 1990, which clearly demonstrated that it was no longer merely a matter of power aimed at the occupation, colonization, and establishment of a colonial system in Kosovo, but much more: a matter of intentional systematic degrading of Albanians and their impoverishment, endangerment of their health, their existence, and displacement ([Islami, 20001, 8](#)).

The new legal and constitutional reality of 1989 gained traction in everyday life through widespread and multifaceted discrimination, especially in the economic sphere, as an additional step towards constructing a new image that was intended to be installed within the institutions and society itself. In the economic domain, a series of violent actions were adopted, and as a result, "in only one year, violent measures were introduced in 237 economic firms in Kosovo, primarily in the most successful businesses" [Islami \(2001, 8\)](#). However, a complete disregard for human rights was implemented. These included the right to freedom of thought and expression [Aral \(2004\)](#), the right to work [Cooke \(2011\)](#), the right to a peaceful existence, and the right to education in the mother tongue [Cooke \(2011\)](#), among others [Shapiro \(1994\)](#). There had no other choice except to devise a means of civic resistance and a parallel existence. All the measures mentioned above were at full service of collapsing these economic enterprises first to dismiss the Albanians employed in them and then start the policy of filling the vacancies with "employees" that came from Serbia. Thus, ethnically, and politically motivated economic segregation has occurred. "To carry out such a procedure, the Albanian managerial personnel were replaced, and the Albanian employees were fired. On this basis, and under the guise of eliminating technological surplus, around 145 thousand workers were terminated" ([Shatri, 2001, 110](#)).

As a first step prior to implementing other actions that will exacerbate the issue in general, this is where the racial segregation in all state companies began, with the intention of constructing a new infrastructure and a completely distinct atmosphere in each workplace. In addition, this new behavior engendered a significant deal of discontent among Albanians, who naturally rejected such a discriminating and exclusive policy, which was being executed through entirely irrational tactics and an unjust policy. Thus, as a “rule”, “good policy became immoral policy that was immoral, but successful: the art of usurpation and holding power by all means”(Maritain, 2000, 87).

Thus, through the usurpation of legal and constitutional terrain, the moral basis of such a policy, guided by irrationality, was also questioned. The irrationality of such unconstitutional actions produced a moral crisis in the political domain, which examined the very existence of the society while the society itself “is a product of reason and moral force, (Maritain, 1997, 26), being questioned not only as human freedom, but as existence as well. Even while the attack originated from the legal and constitutional realm and extended to all aspects of life, it put political and human morals to the test, since the existence of a majority was threatened by the inclination to protect and expand the interests of a minority ethnicity. All these legal and constitutional actions, and of other natures subsequently, constituted an open attempt for a moral breakdown, above all, by the way of submission and conditioning in various forms. Many actions of similar nature produced a difficult economic and psychological situation and, above all, a completely new reality of a non-completion of the individual, who was being attacked more and more by the lack of his individual and collective freedoms alike. Therefore, here and hence, we see that the attack was already different, beyond the legal one. So, it was a moral, spiritual attack which urged a parallel life through a civil resistance.

And when disintegration is already both moral and material, it provides a new social, economic, and political setting because humans "are also persons as carriers of dignity, intellectual activity, and freedom, as a whole with a transcendent destiny, as an end, not a means "(Maritain, 2000, 15). Thus, from 1989 to 1999, the Albanians were deprived of two basic and fundamental rights for a society: freedom and self-determination. The collective insult against the Kosovar society violated both of these rights and gravely harmed its dignity. This historical-political perspective enables us to perceive how this period was primarily exacerbated by the absence of peace, freedom, stability, and fundamental requirements for survival, as manifestations of widespread acquiescence. In this regard, one can now freely refer to the liberal-conservative concept of peace and stability as valuable standards, as well as the values of "freedom," "self-determination," and "limits of self-governments," as well as any other values or standards related to the capacity to ensure peace and stability (Przeworski, 2010).

Therefore, when peaceful order and stability itself is disrupted, it results in instability at all levels, and peace, equality, and freedom are already in jeopardy; and, regardless of whether we refer to the liberal-conservative concept of freedom or its radical concept, "the statement of the past century about 'self-determination' could conceptually be lined up along the 'axis' of freedom as peace versus freedom as equality" [Aguestad \(2020\)](#), both of which were historically. The right to self-determination is already in issue due to violations of equality and freedom. This argument is bolstered by the fact that if the legal status of a state is not typical in terms of geographical sovereignty, then it is also legally ambiguous and questionable which fits the historical and political situation of Kosovo rather well.

Due to the disruption of the constitutional and legal order, the Albanians are compelled to tell a story about a form of self-determination when faced with such a circumstance. Although the right to self-determination "is one of the fundamental political principles of relations between peoples and states in today's world, Serbia interfered extensively with the right of Albanians to determine their own fate, causing further disruption. Self-determination, despite being a right for all people, and which should have resulted from their desire for freedom and democracy, with an intertwining of individual and collective rights, is not supported everywhere, as demonstrated in this case so long as the Albanians were not a national minority ([Agani, 2008](#)).

Nevertheless, in the instance of Kosovo, it is evident that the right to self-determination was suppressed, as if there had been an attempt to extinguish life itself through the most ruthless imaginable interference in the essential institutions of a society. Even though this right was declared inalienable in order to sustain life on an equal footing with the right to dignity, it was not receiving support for its fulfilment. Although the right to self-determination entails the right of the people to determine their own fate, it is not permissible to interfere with the life of a country, demolish its schools and institutions, violate its customs and habits, repress its language, or restrict its rights [Augestad \(2020\)](#). Moreover, the right to self-determination in Kosovo's case must be viewed from a different perspective, namely the historical aspect and the aspect of developments that have occurred in the history of the peoples of the region, who have shared a history during the same period, but with radically different principles. The *uti possidetis* principle therefore also applies to Kosovo's boundaries. But the self-determination agents were incorporated in the parallel state and peaceful resistance political ideology. Self-organization and its three primary pillars—solidarity, healthcare, and education—have been mandated by the parallelism with the new state building.

In social self-organization, an extraordinary role was played by the "Mother Teresa" association, which initially had identified families and individuals with social needs following the principle of "the poorest among the

poorest". "In 1990 there were 2,450 families with 15,084 members, in 1991 there were 26,700 families with 174,084 members, in 1992 there were 43,320 poor families with 282,446 members, in 1993 there were 45,835 families with 373,994 members, in 1994 there were 57,353 poor families with 373,942 members, in 1995 a total of 55,470 poor families with 373,942 members, in 1996 a total of 62,340 poor families with 404,465 members, in 1997 there were 59,700 poor families with 389,244 members" ["Përgjoka Pjetër & Berisha Rami \(2005\)](#). These numbers show that the number of families identified as poor families increases from year to year.

Following the identification, the same organization begins the process of aid collection and distribution. Thus, solidarity assumed the characteristics of an individual and social value of solidarity. Self-organization as a habit became unavoidable in healthcare when, in July 1990, the Parliament of Serbia imposed aggressive measures on the health system in Kosovo and obliterated it. Self-organization inside the "Mother Teresa" association's network of ambulances was an appropriate approach. As the number of patients came and went, so did the number of doctors willing to contribute in this direction. As a result, "wherever there were fired doctors and nurses, generous people offering homes without compensation, and a bit of good organization among the villagers, a new 'Mother Teresa' ambulance was opened. 92 of them were registered for seven years but most likely the records will not be accurate because the real number goes to over 100" ([Demolli, 2012](#)).

In addition to healthcare, the situation in the field of education deteriorates even more, especially after the rejection of school curricula which Serbia imposed. The non-acceptance of these programs is taken to "fire more than 5000 high school teachers; over 850 university professors are expelled, over 20,000 students and about 60,000 high school students are expelled from school premises" ([Agani, 2002](#)). After this action, even in this sphere there was no other alternative but self-organization. "A special contribution in this regard was made by all education workers at all levels, from pre-school and primary education to secondary and higher education, with approximately 22,000 of them, approximately 400,000 pupils and students, and approximately 3,000 heads of households who opened their homes to this large number of pupils and students" ([Shatri, 2010](#)).

Kosovo, like the republics of the former Yugoslavia that declared their sovereignty and independence, represents a case of external self-determination and, at the same time, a case of classical occupation and systematic state repression against a nation that is unable to exercise its right to be the master of its own destiny, despite the satisfaction of three essential conditions [Stavileci \(2001\)](#). Beyond that, self-determination is Kosovo's only path to peace, freedom, and stability, and this is strengthened by the United Nations Charter of 1945, which included the terminology of self-determination, because "self-determination" was included into international law at that time. "One goal of today's exporters

of written constitutionalism is to provide emerging nations with the invaluable gift of democratic self-government" (Rubinfeld, 2001).

The concept of parallel life presented the civic context necessary for self-determination-related political endeavors as a significant foundation for the state-building process. The sub-political aspect of this life, exemplified by civil resistance, is intended to be a peaceful democratic process that creates the new political bodies of the independent state. President Wilson of the United States introduced and gave international weight to the discourse on self-determination in 1918. As a result, "self-determination was one of Wilson's fourteen points in the Peace Conference, which was accepted by the League of Nations and found a place in the anti-fascist powers' statements during the Second World War" Agani (2002). Adherence to this idea aided governance and contributed to the occurrence of as few violent conflicts as possible, hence upholding the principle of equality, the right to self-determination from which a permanent peace would emerge, and the United Nations Charter. Agani (2002) The first article of the Charter states that the objective of the United Nations is to establish cordial relations among nations based on respect for the principle of equal rights and self-determination of people. Faced with such a pervasive disruption of life, the Albanians were compelled to fight for self-determination, as they saw this as the only road to a lasting peace.

As long as all people have the right to self-determination and the ability to determine their own political and socio-cultural destiny, no one has the authority to violate their rights unless they are chosen by those people. It has been said numerous times that no one can lawfully speak or act on behalf of a group unless he or she has been elected by the group's equal members. This concept appears to symbolize the equality of a group, not just as a question of collective freedom but also as a prerequisite for individual liberty (Agestad, 2020). The Albanians in Kosovo had no higher claim than the right to determine their own fate, especially under the current conditions where the right to life was being trampled along with all other rights and the very minimum of individual and collective liberties was not being maintained.

Consequently, the Kosovar society proved that "the force of nations fighting for freedom may be greater than that of nations fighting for enslavement" by making attempts to maintain long-lasting stability despite a discriminating and exclusive policy Maritain (2000). In spite of these expulsions, the Albanians who refused to recognize the legitimacy of the Serbian state and participated in a parallel Albanian political organization Vickers (2004), which was erroneously referred to as a secret organization despite the fact that it was anything but, made the most serious attempt to rebuild life in all of its domains. There is no secret to constructing parallel life so long as it originates from a defiance that pushes an individual and the collective towards rejection or even imposes parallel life, which Sharp would describe as "massive political defiance" Sharp (2012), or when all of this leads to nonviolent action. While Sharp

has established a thorough theory of non-violent action, Hana Arendt has found that non-violent resistance can illuminate her theoretical studies on political action and direct democracy. In 1958, she included an epilogue to her second (expanded) edition of *The Origin of Totalitarianism*, which discussed workers' strikes and workers' councils that had flourished in Hungary a month after the Soviet reconquest (Carter, 2009).

In addition to being a form of resistance, these actions and others of a similar kind provide for gaining time and constructing a whole infrastructure to deal with the situation and establish preconditions for altering reality itself. Consequently, "the modes of action may vary and have included protests, vigils, petitions, strikes, job cuts, and boycotts, as well as remaining at home, lingering, and establishing parallel government institutions" Roberts and Ash (2009). The struggle for survival and preservation of life was won because of the non-violent conflict waged in Kosovo for a decade, between 1989 and 1999. Nonetheless, the desire and willingness of the community for a battle without violence were evident during this time. Gandhi viewed this as a "constructive program" – self-organized attempts to reform society – and a *swaraj*, a rich notion that linked personal self-realization through many levels of decentralized government to the achievement of a national objective (Clark, 2000). Individual or collective self-realization was already seen only through such a policy of resistance, despite increasingly aggressive efforts that could provoke a different behavior in this sense. However, when the state plays a repressive role, so violating fundamental human rights and liberties, it cannot be viewed from any other angle than that of the state's new function.

Research Methodology

The current study is based on secondary data. Secondary data from previous studies, books, internet, and other sources are used to conclude. The methodology of this study to theoretical research and exploration, analysis and study of texts and data that exist to date. In addition to helping the findings that have been partially discussed, and more in the publicistic field than in the scientific one, now come here as confirmed and reconfirmed with strong support on theoretical research. As a result of this resistance and defiance in the face of all that legal, political, and physical pressure exerted upon Albanians, an entire system of self-organization and survival in a challenging period was built in education, health, and almost all other fields, creating the basis of a new independent state. That self-organization and survival managed to keep life within its borders and push forward the right to self-determination at the same time.

Conclusion

Numerous resolutions adopted by the European Parliament, the United States Senate, and the parliaments of several European countries established those systematic violations of human rights, particularly those

stipulated and guaranteed by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, were taking place in Kosovo beginning in the late eighties of the previous century.

In this context, the question arises as to whether the state is a necessary regardless of its behavior, whether it is a precondition for the continuation of humanity, or whether alternative forms can emerge as a reaction against an oppressive state. These challenges and questions regarding the role of the state in political theory have been highlighted for quite some time. Is the state (as a "apparatus of violence" or, in the words of Thomas Hobbes, "a leviathan monster") a necessary evil without which life is not conceivable, or is it a "creation" of advanced patterns of life organization, resulting from Rousseau's social contract? ([Berishaj, 2014](#)). Even though states have frequently exceeded their function and, in our case, have been exclusionary, the position of the state in society has been viewed as essential.

Despite the fact that the society in this instance lacked state protection, it was the state itself that excluded and discredited the society in all possible ways, so earning it the moniker of stateless society. At the very least, the term "stateless" suggested that these individuals had lost the protection of their government and were seeking international accords to maintain their legal existence ([Arendt \(2002\)](#)). This entire circumstance led to the condition stated by Kant: Nothing can prevent the world from becoming an everlasting grave, and lasting peace from becoming a cemetery. Worse yet, all conflicts appear to conflate man with a simple machine and refer to him as an instrument in someone's hands (of the Statestate), leaving no possibility to perceive human space as a human right ([Kant, 2004](#)).

This is the source of all the opposition to such pressure, on the one hand, and the demand for self-determination, on the other. Therefore, the explosion, or as we have referred to it, the bringing of freedom, is the quality of resistance. As a result of civil resistance, new autonomous state institutions will emerge as a unique entity. As a result of this resistance and defiance in the face of all the legal, political, and physical pressure exerted upon the Albanians, an entire system of self-organization and survival in an extremely difficult period was established in education, health, and nearly all other fields, laying the foundation for a new independent state. That self-organization and survival were able to retain life inside its limits while simultaneously advancing the right to self-determination.

Implications of the Study

Civil resistance is one of the most critical areas of research. Therefore, by considering the importance of civil resistance, a number of previous studies discussed civil resistance ([Banai \(2015\)](#); [Boli and Elliott \(2008\)](#); [Carter \(2009\)](#); [Clark \(2000\)](#); [Fierstein \(2008\)](#)). Furthermore, other studies also evaluated self-determination differently and using various dimensions ([McConnell \(1997\)](#); [Murdoch \(1959\)](#); [Van Biema \(2007\)](#); [Van den Broeck et al. \(2021\)](#)). However, the literature rarely addresses the integration

between civil resistance and self-determination. Studies have discussed both these elements separately, however, the combination between these factors is not addressed by previous studies. Therefore, this study filled the significant literature gap and extended the knowledge in self-determination and civil resistance. Furthermore, this study contributed to the literature by considering Kosovo. Literature addressed self-determination and civil resistance, but it is not discussed in the context of Kosovo. Thus, this study assessed the unique relationship between self-determination and civil resistance in Kosovo and contributed to the body of literature. Hence, this study filled several literature gaps that led to major practical implications.

Recommendations

This proves that civil resistance has been proven as extremely successful in sustaining life, therefore, the practitioners must consider it. Furthermore, in the context of this paper, it is reconfirmed that civil resistance and parallelism are interrelated with each other to help in coping, but also in responding concerning all that pressure which require intention of the practitioners. Civil resistance and self-determination should be studied in various other aspects to clear the relationship and provide various other insights for the practitioners.

References

- Agani, F. (2002). "Pavarësia, gjasa dhe shpresë, vepra 7" (Independence, probability and hope, Volume 7). Peja: Dukagjini.
- Agani, F. (2008). "Studime sociologjike dhe politologjike" (Sociological and political science studies). Prishtina: Academy of Sciences and Arts of Kosovo (ASAK).
- Agani, F. (2002). Demokracia, Kombi, Vetëvendosja (Democracy, Nation, Self-Determination. Peja: Dukagjini.
- Aguestad, R. K. (2020). "Lufta për liri në diskursin ndërkombëtar çaste të "Vetëvendosjes"(The fight for freedom in the international discourse moments of "Self-Determination". Prishtina: Koha.
- Ambinder, M., & Grady, D. B. (2013). *Deep State: Inside the Government Secrecy Industry, 44-50.*: John Wiley & Sons.
- Andersen, A. N. (1995). A classification of Australian ant communities, based on functional groups which parallel plant life-forms in relation to stress and disturbance. *Journal of biogeography*, 15-29. doi:<https://doi.org/10.2307/2846070>
- Aral, B. (2004). The idea of human rights as perceived in the Ottoman Empire. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 454-482. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1353/hrq.2004.0015>
- Asadi, M., & Bayramoglu, I. (2005). A note on the mean residual life function of a parallel system. *Communications in Statistics-Theory and Methods*, 34(2), 475-484. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/03610920509342434>

- Bamber, M., & Svensson, I. (2022). Resisting Radical Rebels: Variations in Islamist Rebel Governance and the Occurrence of Civil Resistance. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 1-21. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2021.2019023>
- Banai, A. (2015). Freedom beyond the threshold: self-determination, sovereignty, and global justice. *Ethics & Global Politics*, 8(1), 244-46. doi:<https://doi.org/10.3402/egp.v8.24446>
- Beer, M. (2021). Civil Resistance Tactics in the 21st Century, 1-116. . *International Center for Nonviolent Conflict*, <https://www.nonviolent-conflict.org/civil-resistance-tactics-in-the-21st-century/> (accessed 24 June 2021).
- Berishaj, K. A. (2014). "Shoqëria pa shtet"- Studim Socioantropologjik (Society without a state "- Socioanthropological Study). Prishtina: Academy of Sciences and Arts of Kosovo (ASAK).
- Behnke, A. (2012). Eternal peace, perpetual war? A critical investigation into Kant's conceptualisations of war. *Journal of International Relations and Development*, 15(2), 250-271. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1057/jird.2011.23>
- Bellamy, A. J. (2000). Human Wrongs in Kosovo: 1974-99. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 4(3-4), 105-126. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/13642980008406895>
- Boli, J., & Elliott, M. A. (2008). Façade diversity: The individualization of cultural difference. *International Sociology*, 23(4), 540-560. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580908090727>
- Boonstra, B., & Rauws, W. (2021). Ontological diversity in urban self-organization: Complexity, critical realism and post-structuralism. *Planning Theory*, 20(4), 303-324. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/1473095221992392>
- Caplan, R. (1998). International diplomacy and the crisis in Kosovo. *International Affairs*, 74(4), 745-761. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-2346.00043>
- Carter, A. (2009). "People power and protest: The literature on Civil Resistance in Historical Context". In "Civil Resistance & Power Politics", by Edited by Adam Roberts & Timothy Garton Ash, 32.
- Chenoweth, E., & Stephan, M. J. (2014). Drop your weapons: When and why civil resistance works. *Foreign Aff.*, 93, 94.
- Clark, H. (2000). *Civil resistance in Kosovo*, 1-258. : Pluto Press.
- Cooke, T. (2011). The pastor as model for peaceful existence. *Verbum et ecclesia*, 32(2), 1-6. doi:<https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v32i2.500>
- Demolli, G. (2012). "A war in a different way". Prishtina: Koha.
- Duponchelle, F., Paradis, E., Ribbink, A. J., & Turner, G. F. (2008). Parallel life history evolution in mouthbrooding cichlids from the African Great Lakes. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 105(40), 15475-15480. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0802343105>
- Fierstein, D. (2008). Kosovo's Declaration of Independence: An incident analysis of legality, policy and future implications. *BU Int'l LJ*, 26, 417.
- Friedlander, R. A. (1979). Terrorism and Self-Determination: The Fatal Nexus. *Syracuse J. Int'l L. & Com.*, 7, 263.

- Grinin, L. E. (2003). The early state and its analogues. *Social evolution & history*, 2(1), 131-176.
- Harland, D. (2010). Kosovo and the UN. *Survival*, 52(5), 75-98. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/00396338.2010.522097>
- ICJ, Reports. (2010). "Accordance with International Law of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence in Respect of Kosovo, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 2010,." Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports, Hague. Accessed 2 27, 2022. <https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/141>.
- Islami, H. (2001). "Fjala e hapjes e Hivzi Islamit, sekretar i Seksionit të Shkencave Shoqërore të ASHAK." Gjenocidi i pushtetit serb ndaj shqiptarëve në Kosovë gjatë viteve 90 – Akademia e Shkencave dhe e Arteve e Kosovës (Opening remarks by Hivzi Islami, Secretary of the Social Sciences Section of the ASAK. "The genocide of the Serbian government against the Albanians in Kosovo during the 90s - Academy of Sciences and Arts of Kosovo). Prishtina: ASAK. 8.
- Jesmin, S., & Salway, S. (2000). Marriage among the urban poor of Dhaka: instability and uncertainty. *Journal of International Development: The Journal of the Development Studies Association*, 12(5), 689-705. doi:[https://doi.org/10.1002/1099-1328\(200007\)12:5<689::AID-JID704>3.0.CO;2-2](https://doi.org/10.1002/1099-1328(200007)12:5<689::AID-JID704>3.0.CO;2-2)
- Jessop, B. (2015). *The State: Past, Present, Future*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Kant, I. (2004). "Drejt Paqes së Përhershme" (Towards Eternal Peace). Tirana: Dritan.
- Kalyvas, S. N., & Kocher, M. A. (2009). The dynamics of violence in Vietnam: An analysis of the hamlet evaluation system (HES). *Journal of Peace Research*, 46(3), 335-355. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/0022343309102656>
- King, R., & Vullnetari, J. (2009). Remittances, return, diaspora: framing the debate in the context of Albania and Kosova. *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*, 9(4), 385-406. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/14683850903314907>
- Kreuter, A. (2010). Self-Determination, Sovereignty, and the Failure of States: Somaliland and the Case for Justified Secession. *Minn. J. Int'l L.*, 19, 363.
- Lemay-Hébert, N. (2011). The "empty-shell" approach: the setup process of international administrations in Timor-Leste and Kosovo, its consequences and lessons. *International Studies Perspectives*, 12(2), 190-211. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-3585.2011.00427.x>
- Llewellyn, K. N. (1935). On what is wrong with so-called legal education. *Colum. l. rev.*, 35, 651. doi:<https://doi.org/10.2307/1115746>
- Lunev, A. N., Safin, R. S., Korchagin, E. A., Sharafutdinov, D. K., Suchkova, T. V., Kurzaeva, L. V., . . . NatalKuznetsova, N. A. (2016). The mechanism of industrial educational clusters creation as managerial entities of vocational education. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 6(2S), 166-171.
- Lynch, A. (2002). Woodrow Wilson and the principle of 'national self-determination': a reconsideration. *Review of International Studies*, 28(2), 419-436. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0260210502004199>

- Maran, C. M. (2009). Parallel life on social network: A study. *IUP Journal of Management Research*, 8(12), 7.
- Maritain, J. (2000). "Njeriu dhe shteti"(The man and the state). Tirana: ISP&Dita.
- McConnell, M. W. (1997). The Right to Die and the Jurisprudence of Tradition. *Utah L. Rev.*, 665.
- Michaels, J. D. (2018). The American deep state. *Notre Dame L. Rev.*, 93, 1653.
- Pomerance, M. (1976). The United States and self-determination: Perspectives on the Wilsonian conception. *American Journal of International Law*, 70(1), 1-27. doi:<https://doi.org/10.2307/2200560>
- Përgjoka P & Berisha R. (2005). Dashuri për të gjithë, "Nëna Terezë" (Love for all, "Mother Teresa". Prishtina: Humanitarian Charitable Association "Mother Teresa".
- Przeworski, A. (2010). *Democracy and the limits of self-government*: Cambridge University Press.
- Roberts A & Ash T G (Eds.). (2011). *Civil Resistance and Power Politics: The Experience of Non-Violent Action from Gandhi to the Present*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Roberts, A., & Ash, T. G. (2009). *Civil resistance and power politics: the experience of non-violent action from Gandhi to the present*: Oxford university press.
- Rubinfeld, J. (2001). *Freedom and Time: A Theory of Constitutional Self-Government*. London: Yale University Press: New Haven and London.
- Scott, P. D. (2014). The State, The deep State, and the Wall Street Overworld." *The Asia-Pacific Journal*. 12, (10, No. 5).
- Sharp, G. (2012). "Nga diktatura në demokraci" (From From dictatorship to democracy) Tirana: "Pika pa sipërfaqe"(The point without surface).
- Shatri, B. (2010). "ARSIMI SHQIP NË KOSOVË 1990-1999 SHTËPITË SHKOLLA-Sfidat,arritjet dhe aspiratat" ALBANIAN EDUCATION IN KOSOVO 1990-1999 SCHOOL HOUSES - Challenges, achievements and aspirations). Prishtina: LIBRI SHKOLLOR.
- Shatri, H. (2001). "Gjenocidi serb mbi bazën socioekonomike të Kosovës." Gjenocidi i pushtetit serb ndaj shqiptarëve në Kosovë gjatë viteve 90 – Akademia e Shkencave dhe e Arteve e Kosovës (The Serbian genocide on the socio-economic basis of Kosovo. "The genocide of the Serbian government against the Albanians in Kosovo during the 90s - K Academy of Sciences and Arts of Kosovo. Prishtina : ASAK. 110.
- Stavileci, E. (2001). "VAZHDIMËSIA E MENDIMIT PËR KOSOVËN DHE ÇËSHTJEN SHQIPTARE" (CONTINUATION OF THOUGHT ABOUT KOSOVO AND THE ALBANIAN ISSUE).
- Stavileci, E. (1996). ""Ndryshimet kushtetuese dhe likuidimi i autonomisë"." Instituti i Historisë – Prishtinë, "Çështja e Kosovës – një problem historik dhe aktual", Simpozium i mbajtur në Tiranë më 15-16 prill 1993 (Constitutional changes and the liquidation of autonomy." Institute of History - Prishtina, "The Kosovo issue - a

- historical and current problem”, Symposium held in Tirana on April 15-16, 1993). Prishtina: Institute of History. 293.
- Taylor, E. B., Foote, C. J., & Wood, C. C. (1996). Molecular genetic evidence for parallel life-history evolution within a Pacific salmon (sockeye salmon and kokanee, *Oncorhynchus nerka*). *Evolution*, 50(1), 401-416.
- Tunander, O. (1989). The logic of deterrence. *Journal of Peace Research*, 26(4), 353-365.
doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/0022343389026004003>.
- Vickers, M. (2004). “Midis serbëve dhe shqiptarëve – Një histori e Kosovës”(Between Serbs and Albanians - A History of Kosovo). Tirana: Toena.
- Weller, M. (2009). *Contested Statehood: Kosovo's Struggle for Independence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Zajmi, G. (1996). “Çështja e Kosovës në kuadër të çështjes shqiptare si sfidë madhore e kohës dhe ndaj kohës”. “Çështja e Kosovës – një problem historik dhe aktual”, Simpozium i mbajtur në Tiranë më 15-16 prill 1993 (“The case of Kosovo in the context of the Albanian case as a major challenge of the time and against the time”. “The case of Kosovo - a historical and current problem”, Symposium held in Tirana on April 15-16, 1993. Prishtina: Institute of History. 244.